

RECEIVED  
USDC, WESTERN DISTRICT OF  
LOUISIANA  
TONY R. MOORE, CLERK  
7/2/15  
JT

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF LOUISIANA  
ALEXANDRIA DIVISION

---

CHANDAR BINGHAM

CIVIL ACTION NO. 12-479

VERSUS

JUDGE TRIMBLE

WARDEN MENIFEE, ET AL.

MAGISTRATE JUDGE KIRK

---

J U D G M E N T

For the reasons contained in the Report and Recommendation of the Magistrate Judge previously filed herein, and after independent review of the entire record, including all objections and responses thereto, it is the finding of this court that the Motion for Summary Judgment filed by Defendants should be and is hereby

**GRANTED** in its entirety, dismissing all claims against them by Plaintiff. The court agrees with the argument advanced in Defendants' objections found at R. 35 and finds that Plaintiff's amended complaint does not allege two (2) separate fights, but rather a verbal altercation and subsequent physical altercation.<sup>1</sup>

Given these findings, it is hereby

**ORDERED, ADJUDGED and DECREED** that Plaintiff's claims against Defendants in this suit are **DENIED and DISMISSED** with prejudice.

**THUS DONE AND SIGNED** in chambers at Alexandria, Louisiana this 2<sup>nd</sup> day of July, 2015.

---

  
JAMES T. TRIMBLE, JR.  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

---

<sup>1</sup> R. 13.